

Pakistan's First National Security Policy 2022-2026: The Analysis of Security Compulsions and Objectives

Jawwad Riaz

Assistant Professor, Punjab University Law College, Lahore

Freeha Naz

Assistant Professor, Queen Mary Graduate College, Lahore

Abstract

Security and stability are always been an integral aim of human life so is the case with states. A state's security paradigm is a determined or undetermined path to make its survival possible depending on the environment it is interacting. Pakistan's security path is also determined by the environment it was interacting. It made alliances with West at times to enhance its hard-core national security but after 9/11 a drastic change was observed. Pakistan reconsidered its national security policy by focusing on the soft core of its national security path. The aim of writing this article is to see what factors led Pakistan to transform its focus from hard core to soft core of national security and its path to formulate its first national security policy 2022-2026. This article also elaborates the past national security directives of the state along with the national security compulsions it is facing. Thus, this article gives a detailed overview or genesis of Pakistan's first national security policy 2022-2026 along with its shortcomings.

Key Words: National Security, Military Security, Soft Security, Hard Security, Security Compulsions

Introduction

According to Thomas Hobbes, an eminent scholar, "man was in perpetual state of fear and insecurity". In order to mitigate this state of fear and



insecurity, man surrendered some of his rights and reached on a social contract, there by established a governing authority to ensure his safety and self-preservation. This narrative suggests that self-preservation serves as a driving force behind the creation of the state. (Bilts 1989) Later on it becomes a fundamental objective of all states to enable their citizens to live without the constant fear of losing their lives and to engage fully in all aspects of society. This primary goal, as advocated by Etzioni through the concept of the "Primacy of Life," aims to establish a strong ethical foundation and gain widespread approval. (Etzioni 2007) This approach focuses on ensuring basic security. The concept of national security, which means "a state's survival in an anarchic global environment", is the widely accepted way of conceptualizing the strategies a state employs to ensure its survival. (Moller 2000) Nonetheless, a tangible evaluation of policy elements such as military capabilities, security partnerships, territorial integrity, political and economic stability, availability of resources, environmental sustainability, and cooperative strategies is essential to comprehensively determine the path a nation takes to ensure its security and survival across various domains.

Main Argument: Pakistan's national security paradigm transformed from hard core to soft core after 9/11 due to the environment it was interacting with that led Pakistan to formulate its first national security policy 2022-2026.

Hypothesis: The national security paradigm of Pakistan transitioned from a traditional hard-core focus on military and territorial defense to a more comprehensive soft-core approach, encompassing counterterrorism, socioeconomic development, and regional cooperation, as a result of the geopolitical, economic, and security environment it interacted with after 9/11 that enabled Pakistan to formulate its first national security policy 2022-2026.

Research Questions

- I. What were the primary compulsions in the geopolitical environment after-9/11 that influenced Pakistan's transition from a hard-core to a soft-core national security paradigm?

2. What are the major security threats and challenges spotlights in the NSP 2022-2026?
3. How did geopolitical, economic, and social factors influence the development of the NSP?
4. What are the main objectives and strategies outlined in the NSP?
5. How is the NSP expected to influence Pakistan's security environment during its implementation period?

Research Design

This research work employs qualitative research methods to gain in-depth insights into the policy formulation process and its content. Secondary data is taken from government documents, official statements, policy briefs, and media reports related to Pakistan's NSP. It is a case study that helps to give in-depth overview of Pakistan's national security policy with content analysis by identifying the key strategies, objectives and themes. It is also an analytical study of the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats associated with the NSP.

Theoretical Framework

Theoretical lens provides a structured view of a phenomena .A framework consists of various theories and concepts of interdisciplinary study from political science, international relations, and security studies to understand the policy's development in Pakistan particularly after 9/11 comprehensively. Realism school of thought accentuates the state's pursuits for national interest in anarchic environment at both global and regional level. (Hans Morgenthau 1948) It helps to elaborate the strategic decision making of Pakistan. This perspective provides a detail insights of Pakistan's perception of threats emanating from neighbors: India and Afghanistan and also the influence of U.S and China in this regard. The liberal school of thought evaluates the economic development and regional cooperation are integrated into the NSP 2022-2026 Of Pakistan. - Analyze how Pakistan's national identity and historical context influence its security policy. The most relevant theoretical perspective is the critical theory studies that helps to elaborates how the NSP 2022-2026 of Pakistan incorporates non-traditional security threats, such as

economic instability, environmental issues, and social challenges as its key challenges to the state. Thus, this theoretical framework consisting of multiple perspectives provides a comprehensive overview of the genesis of Pakistan's NSP 2022-2026. By integrating theories from realism, liberalism, constructivism, and critical security studies researchers can better overview the major influences and implications of Pakistan's first NSP.

Pakistan's National Security

States operate in anarchic environment to ensure their security either through convergence or divergence. Pakistan's security narrative is outcome of the last eight decades of its historical experience of identity crisis during British rule before independence. The extreme violence followed by the partition of subcontinent and post partition apprehension of potential threats posed by India provided the grounds to Pakistan being a security centric state. The anarchic environment led Pakistan to a natural focus on enhancing military security to protect the state against the animosity of a belligerent and larger neighbor India. Pakistan's foreign policy choices soon after its birth, its defense alliances (CEATO & SENTO), its eagerness for nuclear program, and its partnership in war of Afghanistan against Russia and then its participation in global war against terror as front line state after 9/11, were the evidences that Pakistan was relying on military based national security narrative. However after 9/11, the state of militancy, radicalization, terrorist acts and extreme political polarization led Pakistan to give it a thought to shift its national security narrative from traditional to nontraditional. The need for political and economic stability, societal harmony, climatic and environmental sustainability were considered equally important with military security. *The Malakand / Swat counterterrorism operations 2009, AHBP 2010, 18th Constitutional Amendment 2010, 7th NFC Award 2010, Operation Zarb-e-Azb 2014, National Action Plan 2015, and Diamer-Bhasha Dam* were national security moves initiated across the all sectors of state . Despite all these moves, political polarization remained on peak. Economic

degradation, climatic changes, societal issues like militancy, radicalization, political exclusion of minorities, water scarcity, corruption, inflation, energy crisis, global image of the country and terror financing were the challenges beyond the state capacity. These were the internal shocks that led to formulate National Action Plan in 2015. (Rumi 2015) Pak-India relations, Pak-Afghanistan and Iran relations and limited foreign policy options in terms of Gulf States were also creating hurdles in the path of its national security. Keeping in view above mentioned challenges, merger of FATA in KPK and formulation of National Security Policy 2022 were the two major political securitization moves of the state. In societal security, after Covid19, Pakistan has collaborated with WHO to maintain the human security. In economic security, Pakistan managed to fulfill its obligations with IMF and other global aid providing organizations. Pakistan is one of the countries who are facing the worse of global warming in terms of climatic changes and water scarcity but it still need the seriousness of the stakeholders. Active engagement in the fight against terrorism has seen numerous securitizing moves in military sector. Pakistan's engagement with FATF is worth mentioning. With this background, Pakistan managed to determine its first national security policy 2022-2026. A systematic and organized study of this policy is helpful to understand the Pakistan's national security priorities. This research work explores Pakistan's first National Security Policy 2022-2026. It critically analyzes the discourse of the policy and also highlights the underlying short comings.

Pakistan's National Security Compulsions

Global politics is an autonomous phenomenon: continuously in state of transformation and transition. In this rapidly changing environment, states have to interact in order to adapt current dynamics of the global politics. The world is increasingly globalized and being multipolar. Emergence of non-state actors has also contributed to the fragility of the world politics. Pakistan's narrative for its survival is greatly influenced due to these three dynamics: globalization, multi-polarity and mantra of non-state actors. (Khokhar 2015)

Pakistan's geographical location adding apprehensions to its security due to its Eastern and Western border neighboring states. At the same time Pakistan's history indicated its fragility in terms of its national security. Wars, natural calamities, disintegration of Pakistan in 1971, rise of extremism, radicalization and terrorism in post Afghan-Russia war period, political and economic instability, low literacy rate, and fragile human security are some of the challenges hampering its national security and forced it to devise a vigorous policy to attain certain goals. Before analyzing national security policy, it is essential to discuss some strengths and compulsions in terms of its national security dynamics. Pakistan's geographical location is its unavoidable strength. Pakistan had played vital role twice for US in its history as a front-line state first against USSR and then against Afghanistan. Now it's playing the same role for China. Pakistan is a beautiful blend in terms of its topography. It is home to plains, high peaks, deserts and a long coastal area. Pakistan is located at a place which has rich history of civilization a fine blend of multi-ethnic and multi-lingual community. Pakistani society and culture consist of many ethnicities: Punjabis, Kashmiris, Saraikis, Makranis, Baloch, Hazaras, Pashtuns, Baltis, and Shinkai communities. From cold war to war of terror, Pakistan not only managed to survive rather it is difficult for global community to avoid its role in global politics. Pakistan having 6774-kilometer-long borders and has vulnerability of intervention from Eastern, Western and Southern borders. (Mahmood Somrez Salik 2019) Dispute in neighbors or with neighbors, fragile economy and domestic challenges like political instability, extremism, terrorism, sectarian violence and militancy are some important compulsions in terms of national security. With the passage of time, Pakistan is increasingly susceptible to internal threats than external ones. Nevertheless, external forces have intensified these internal vulnerabilities. Unfortunately, the international community frequently overlooks the significance of domestic political dynamics particularly defining the policy options a country has both internally and externally. National Integration provides the foundations on which national security narrative stands out in a nation. Internal cohesion and

sentiments of oneness: nationalism inculcate unity, common aspirations, distributive social justice and comprehensive economic and political evolution brings a nation united. Pakistan is still struggling for a unified identity that may undermine ethnic cleavages based on religious, racial, linguistic and political lines. (Hashami 2022) The importance of national intergradation cannot be overlooked for enhancing national security of Pakistan which has diverse cultural society with huge population.

Pakistan's strategy to restrain Soviet Union and its partnership in Global War of Terror contributed in emerging the militant outfits around 1980s. Later on, these militant outfits challenged the writ of state by holding terrorist activities. (Khurshaid Khan 2017). Pakistan's realization to base on soft core of national security instead of hard core was actually based of the losses it had to bear in its war against terrorism. Pakistan has been victim of terrorism and foreign – funded militancy which has adversely affected country's society and economy for decades. In the Global War on Terror (GWOT), Pakistan has suffered 70,000 casualties and US \$ 123 billion in terms of economy. (Tribune 2014) The terrorist outfits like Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) and other militant organizations targeted political leadership, religious minorities, opponents of other sectarian and militant outfits and ethnicities. These militant organizations have hijacked the urban and rural harmony. APS Peshawar 2014 incident was a turning point in the management of national security of the state. Even severity of this incident was more than the fall of twin towers in New York. (Khurshaid Khan 2017) Formulation of National Action Plan and First National Internal Security Policy 2014 were the outcome of the urgency of the incident.

National Internal Security Policy 2014

Keeping in view the Peshawar incident, dealing the security challenges posed by the militant and sectarian outfits was considered essential. In this regard, National Internal Security Policy (NISP) 2014 was formulated to envisage the framework to guide the state. Later on, National Action Plan (NAP) was made the part of it. FATA reforms that led to the merger of FATA to Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) were the lead from the NISP and NAP. In order

to manage the militancy and radicalization, Madrassa reforms were introduced. (Mahmood Somrez Salik 2019)

Basic Features of the first NISP 2014 were following

1. Basic aim of NISP was to protect national interest and deal national security challenges of the state through the institutional response by the National Counter Terrorism Authority (NACTA) based on the idea of mutual integration of all stakeholders so that the base of terrorist network can be separated from any kind of support and most importantly the capacity building of the state institutions to mitigate the challenges of internal security.
2. Dialogue with all sections of society, enhancement of basic human rights, territorial integrity, peaceful solution and capacity enhancement of police and civil armed were taken on board through this policy.
3. NACTA was held responsible for the operationalization and implementation of the goals that required 32 billion rupees. (Ministry Of Interior 2015)

Although, NAP is fully operational since January 2015, yet the nexus between terrorist groups is still to be fully broken because of numerous facilitating factors yet a definite change in the field of economy and security is being observed that created a positive impact on the overall situation in the society.

National Internal Security Policy 2018-2023

In order to deal with the challenges of extremism in the society and rise of Daesh in Afghanistan led Pakistan to formulate its next National Internal Security Policy 2018-2023. The policy was formulated to enhance the internal security with the collaboration of administrative, ideational and socio-economic strategies. National Security Management System (NSMS) was established to bring the civil-military collaboration in this regard. (Mahmood Somrez Salik 2019) NISP 2018 highlights the trends of exclusionary sentiments, detachment to the state on the part of youth, absence of social equity and the rule of law; regional inequalities; absence of accountability and foreign linkages as eminent motives of insecurity.

Furthermore, absence of research environment to comprehend the root causes of religious and ethnic militancy have hindered the formulation of structural policies in this regard. The National Internal Security Policy (NISP) 2018 provides across the board a framework to appertain internal security challenges. The document issued by the Ministry of Interior (2018) builds on NISP 2014, inculcate the experiences acknowledged while imposing NAP. It also suggests future perspectives keeping in view the contemporary dynamics in Pakistan. NISP visualizes a harmonious, democratic and plural society supported by the inculcation of the equality before law, inclusive wellbeing, political harmony, and appreciation for diversity. Hence it lays out for law and order, the establishing of a common vision, giving civil rights and guaranteeing political harmony as its essential objectives and targets. The NISP 2018 depends on an extended vision of security that characterizes harmony not just as the lack of violence, but rather as establishing conditions essential for uplifting social inclusiveness and stability. It coordinates developing measures with endeavors to enhance security and harmony as illustrated in the Pakistan Vision 2025. Moreover, according to Ministry of Interior (2018) it embraces a 'one nation' approach and proposes suggestions to reshape both the 'state' and 'society' for accomplishing economical harmony. These suggestions fall into three key areas:

Administrative Domain: While the Policing agencies and the Military have basic impact in managing the hazard of warfare against terror, there is a need to deal and further improve the capacity of both military and regular civil LEAs to manage unconventional threats. This likewise calls for magnify coordination and strategic cooperation between various government offices and organizations. Measures have been inculcated in this regard needs to be executed on a most optimized level.

Ideational Domain: The core of the extremism is their narrative which employ in the ideational domain. The terrorists progressively impart various methods of correspondence which incorporate their access to masses through internet, obtain sympathy, recruit and get financing for their activities - all of which requires prompt consideration. This Strategy proposes how to target

the philosophical domain of the extremist narrative that enhance the mentality inclined to savagery and terrorism.

Socio-economic Domain: Security challenges can't be settled through administrative ways, or a counter-narrative until profound socio-economic root causes are not addressed. The Strategy identifies the need to connect gaps in society through basic mediation that will fabricate trust among state and society, prompting a more harmonious Pakistan. The NISP 2018 proposed a multi-faceted framework consisting what categories as the 6Rs to meet the ends already indicated. These are: Reorient, Reimagine, Reconcile, Redistribute, Recognize, and the implementation of a Regional Approach. (Minitry Of Interior 2018)

Pakistan's First National Security Policy 2022-2026

The ex-Prime Minister of Pakistan Imran Khan presented first National Security Policy of Pakistan on January 14, 2022. The policy is appreciated by the academic and political camp. It is taken as a new perspective to redefine the traditional domains of defining the Pakistan's National Security paradigm. NSP is fundamentally citizen or human centric, enhancing the economy, restructuring stable ties with India and managing with unconventional threats. The unconventional areas of NSP are the prioritization of the soft cores of national security threats. The transformation of NSP from geostrategic to geo-economic domain is a fresh perspective. (Barrech 2022) It formulates a citizen-centric 'Comprehensive National Security' guidelines. It articulates both conventional and unconventional domains of national security together. The Policy gives economic stability as the base of national security, focusing a geo-economic aspect to support the pivot on geo-strategy, and acknowledges that that sustainable and all-inclusive economic development is all requires to utilize the given national resources. Accomplishing this will allow more prominent accessibility of assets to support both conventional and human security. The focus point of the foreign policy and military ability is to enhance harmony and regional stability and then some, in view of mutual regard and sovereign equity. (Minitry of Interior 2022)

Background

There are five derivatives of Pakistan's socio-economic and security dynamics which steered the politico-military administration to formulate the NSP. These are:

1. Poor social integration.
 2. Worsening economic condition.
 3. The China element
 4. Declining politico-economic conventional support extended by the Gulf States, pertaining to transformed geo-political and economic concerns.
 5. Hostile immediate neighborhood, particularly with India, Iran, and Afghanistan, causing severe socio-economic instability for Pakistan.
- (Arun Sahgal 2022)

Discourse Analysis

Transformation of Pakistan's military based national security posture to a state that is looking to geo-economic consolidation along its security concerns to mitigate. According to the Ministry of Interior document (2022) Pakistan's NSP is basically a briefed document extended up to five years from 2022 to 2026 subject to amend as geo-political and geo-economic dynamics in which Pakistan is operating. The first NSP of Pakistan visualizes it as an Islamic welfare state which is globally relevant and consolidated to universal values of justice, equality, and tolerance. A stable neighborhood and relations consisting of reciprocity, regional integration and economic development are some of the goals associated to this policy. A socially and economically stable Pakistan that is seeking cultural diversity along with provision of fundamental rights on the base of equality. A resilient society with good governance by ensuring strong institutional transparency, accountability and impartiality as convictions.

There are six thematic sections of the NSP 2022-2026 that includes

1. National cohesion.
2. Economic wellbeing.
3. Defense and territorial integrity.

4. Internal security.
5. Balanced foreign policy in the changing world.
6. Human security.

The policy's most eye-catching element is its focus on a prosperity-first approach to national security. 'Inclusive development [is] inevitable for national security', Khan declared at the launch. The policy refers to 'a geo-economic pivot', with Pakistan seeing itself as a 'melting pot of global economic interests' Where the policy sets a potentially new ambition for Pakistan's traditional security approach is in its stated intention to enhance 'space capabilities' and 'information and cyber security'. (Ministry of Interior 2022)

Complacency

Detailed document is an excellent effort but in reality, there are some shortcomings. First, some of Pakistan's most eminent challenges of the state has been miscalculated. The terrorism has been highlighted as the most formidable threat to the stability of state and social and national harmony on the one hand while acknowledging the fact that due to military-led counter-terrorist campaigns domestically reduced this threat to six-fold as compared to 2010. (Levesques 2022) Antoine Levesque (2022) has also categorically mentioned the US State Department concerns that regionally supported terrorist groups are still operating from the soil of Pakistan despite of its zero-tolerance policy for terrorist groups. He also mentioned that Pakistan's distinction among terrorist groups as Islamic militants is the real problem. The document has acknowledged the public debt as a national concern but the possible link to this issue with CPEC has been ignored. The document also calls for reducing 'external economic dependency' but with no clue. Another complacency derives from Pakistan being too optimistic about its ability to deliver on its vision and policy.

Pakistan's First Cloud Policy 2022

A part of Pakistan's first national security policy, Pakistan also announced its first cloud policy as well. NSP 2022-26 aims to protect digital data along with secure access to global cyber environment. The main initiative of the

policy is the “Digital Pakistan Initiative” of the government of Pakistan which aim to promote connectivity, digital skills, and infrastructure, innovation and tech entrepreneurship in Pakistan. It also aimed to enhance major shift in conceptualization of national security. It also aims to promote intra-governmental collaboration, transparency and accountability in public service delivery along with effective utilization of cloud technologies. Thus, it was a major shift towards digitalization of Pakistan. (Rafiq 2022) Though it is a very balanced approach to enhance process of digitalization across all the sectors of society yet the core concern of Pakistan is lack of policy implementation.

Conclusion

Though the country has recently completed ten years of rule by political governments yet still political indecisiveness, leadership deficit and poor governance undermine its ability to execute and monitor internal security policy. With this background Pakistan’s initiative of Its First national security policy 2022-2026 is appreciable but it is yet to see its impacts particularly keeping in view the structural abilities of state to deliver

References

1. Arun Sahgal, Shreyas Duragadasrao, Desmukh. "Pakistan National Security Policy Objective Vs Reality." March 10th, 2022.
2. Barrech, Dost Muhammad. "Pakistan's National Security Policy: Persuing Peace With India." *Pivot* (Institute of Strategic Studies Islamabad (ISSI)), 2022: 58-60.
3. Bilts, Jan H. "Hobbesian Fear." *Political Theory* 17, no. 3 (1989): 417-431.
4. Eizioni, Amitai. *Security First*. New Haven: Yale University, 2007.
5. Hans Morgenthau, Kenneth W. Thompson. *Politics Among Nations: The Struggle for Power and Peace*. McGraw-Hill Education, 1948.
6. Hashami, Naghmana A. "National Integration An Essential Element of National Security." *Pivot* (Institute of Strategic Studies Islamabad) 4, no. 3 (2022): 6-15.
7. Khokhar, Noel Israel. "Prespective On Pakistan's National Security." *NDU* 29, no. 1 (2015).
8. Khurshaid Khan, Fouzia Amin. "Understanding The National Security Culture Of Pakistan." *Strategic Studies*, 2017: 17-37.
9. Levesques, Antione. *Why Pakistan’s First National-Security Policy Matters for Future Regional Stability*. International Institute for Strategic Studies, 2022.
10. Mahmood Somrez Salik, Khadija Younas. "Pakistan's Security Compulsions: External & Internal Dimensions." *Marghalla Papers* 1 (2019): 38-60.
11. Ministry of Interior, Govt of Pakistan. *National Security Policy 2022-26*. Islamabad: Minitry of Interior, Govt of Pakistan, 2022.
12. Minitry Of Interior, Govt. of Pakistan. *National Internal Security Policy 2014-18*. Islamabad: Minitry Of Interior, Govt. of Pakistan, 2015.

Crafting Pakistan's Inaugural National Security Policy (2022-2026): Origins and Objectives

13. Ministry Of Interior, Govt. of Pakistan. *National Internal Security Policy 2018-23*. Islamabad: Ministry Of Interior, Govt. of Pakistan, 2018.
14. Moller, Bjorn. "The Concept of Security: The Pros and Cons of Expansion and Contraction." *Copenhagen Peace Research Institute*. 2000.
<https://ciaotest.cc.columbia.edu/wps/mob01/>.
15. Rafiq, Amina. "Pakistan's First Cloud Policy 2022." *Pivot* (Institute of Strategic Studies Islamabad) 4, no. 3 (2022): 16-18.
16. Rumi, Raza. *Charting Pakistan's Internal Policy: Special Report*. United States Institutes of Peace, 2015, 8.
17. Tribune, The. 2014.