

'Learning to Be Human': The Paradigm of Oakeshott's Epistemology and Islamic Theory of Knowledge

Muhammad Iqbal Shah

*Professor of Philosophy, Government Islamia Graduate College,
Chiniot/Doctoral Candidate, Department of Philosophy, University
of the Punjab, Lahore*

Dr. Ali Raza Tahir

*Associate Head, School of Religion & Philosophy, Minhaj
University, Lahore*

Abstract

Michael Oakeshott's epistemology revolves around the concept of Modes of the understanding of the meanings of the world. These meanings had been mediated by our forefathers and had been descended to us through generation to generations. The whole of these meanings is the common capital for all human beings irrespective of terrestrial affiliation or adherence to any theology or association to any race. Without learning the meanings, we are just a bipod specie or *Homo Erectus* and *Homo Sapiens* but not 'Beings Human'. Thus he founded his epistemology on concept of 'learning to be human' and he made a difference between a 'human being' and 'being human'. Islamic teachings also support Oakeshott's ideas regarding, Epistemology, Theory of Knowledge and educational Philosophy.

Key Words: Conversation, Epistemology, Humanity, Learning, Modes, Morality

I. Introduction

Michael Oakeshott (1905-1990) was a British philosopher. He delineated his theory of epistemology in his seminal work was *Experience and Its Modes*.¹



The novelty of his thoughts lies in the manner he treated the understanding of the world through his 'Modes' of experiences. The word 'experience' is very common in general parlance e.g. that I have an experience of doing so and so, or I have an experience of that job for many years or going to somewhere would be a good experienced. But for him, it is the one among the most difficult word in the vocabulary of philosophy. 'Experience' designates the 'concrete whole'. The analysis of this world splits 'experience' into two categories which are the 'experiencing' one and the other which are being 'experienced.'² His objective was not to deal with the both but to treat the 'experience' itself as a 'concrete whole.' The main feature of experience is thought and judgment and it is a 'world of ideas.' It is totality of facts and truths but not of things.³ Experience implied consciousness,⁴ and what we get through experience is a 'world of ideas.'⁵ This is the common inheritance of human beings and the learning of the meanings of these ideas is the criterion of being human. Thus Oakeshott's epistemology depends on the learning of the meanings of these ideas and the hallmark of his theory is that it makes a unique distinction between the 'human beings' and 'being human' on account of this epistemology. The transmission and learning of these meanings constitutes his educational philosophy as well as his concept of *learning to be human* which aimed at the 'elevated human being' instead of just biped human beings.

2. Five Kingdoms of Existence

Whenever anyone looks around the world, the one will find the following four kinds of existences.

Firstly, there is *Kingdome of Matter*. This is the source of all material things and existence. The world and others are modified expositions of matter. These material things are life-less. They can be composed or deconstructed by others. But they have no force to do something by their own-selves.

Secondly, there is the *Realm of Botanical Stuff* which has life but do not possess mobility force. It has its roots in the earth and it owes its life from various sources of nature. We have named it, the botanical matter.

Thirdly, there is the *Sphere of Zoological Matter* which possesses not only life but also the force of move-ability. We named it the animal world. Due to life as well as moving ability, they are not attached to the earth, thus they can move anywhere. The vital feature of their lives is their latent faculty of learning and responding towards the stimuli of nature. Some of them are domesticated, trained and tamed by human beings to perform certain tricks and perform some jobs.

Fourthly, there is the *Domain of Human Beings*. They are in contrast to the three previous ones have some distinct features e.g. the ability of thinking, the talent of decision making, the aptitude of making choices, the sense of judgments, the attaining of the satisfaction of the *Needs* then mere fulfilling the *Wants* etc. They are the hallmarks attributes of human beings. Thus the *Human Beings* have been considered superior to other existents.

If at this point we agreed and accept the status of human beings as described above, then there is no need to step onward for any research regarding Oakeshott's theory of knowledge and philosophy of education. Oakeshott was not satisfied with the above explanation. For him, this is insufficient explanation of being *human beings* and it lacks some vital elements. He said, at this level, we are *homo erectus* (standing human) who have been descended from the race of the apes.⁶ They sat for long and done conversations and thought about chances or choices. This went so long that they lost their tails.⁷ So the evolution from the third phase of animal kingdom, to the fourth kingdom of the *homo erectus* (standing human); the human beings got different status like, *Homo Sapiens* (intelligent man); *Homo Faber* (man the maker of things); *Homo Laborans* (man the worker); *Homo Ludens* (man the player).⁸

Fifthly, the *Elevated Status of Being Human*: The notion of Being Human has broader prospect than mere being a participant of *Homo Sapiens* species. The word 'Human Being' is a noun for *Sapiens* but the term 'Being Human' is an adjective of some ones among the sapiens. It embraces some salient features or elevated ideas such as morality, sympathy, compassion, kindness, self-awareness, sense of being among other likewise beings, familiarized with

the values of truth, equality and justice. It is deep a rooted consciousness and life-long pursuit as encouragement for cultivation of amicable associations with likewise humankind and the general surroundings.

Though the pursuit of this elevated goal and luminous journey is very onerous yet it is the path towards being human from the state of human being. It requires some extra accounts such as: unbiased disposition, self-consciousness, altruism and sacrificed of egotism. The transition from human being to being human is the real status of humanity. For this transformative drive we have an aptitude of reason and ability of critical thinking they can help us in decision making and understanding the true sense of our pursuit.

3. The difference between the terms of 'Human Being' and 'Being Human'.

The analysis of the above two terms will make us to realize that the former has been characterized as biological and anthropological domain of scientific investigations but the latter has been defined with reference to epistemology, axiology and philosophical thoughts which is generally has particular contexts.

3.1 The former state is being member of the fourth stage as *Home Sapiens*. As 'Human being' we are born, nourished and are destined to live on the earth for a period of life till death as biological existence. During this organic phase, we have experiences as part of the whole with other like-wise human beings. This biological birth is just a natural phenomenon which is designated as the life of a human being.

While the term 'Being Human' hints to the status of being superior in relation to intelligence, knowledge and psychology to the third e.g. animal kingdom and the fourth e.g. *Human Being domain*. The 'Being Human' is dignified in mental capabilities, deliberation, rational activities and creating things by using reflective thinking. They are capable to facilitate the other beings and to change the world. 'Being Human' is an exalted state then that of being just a natural phenomenon. It is embellished with conscious collectivism and with the behavior embroidered by moral values. It exemplifies transcendentalism which exalts a human being from temporary motivation and 'here and now' (*hic et nunc*) concerns.⁹ For the

transformation from human being to 'Being Human', a meaningful, conscious and associational manner of living in a society is required. For this we must realize the latent potentialities and actualize the precepts into behavior with changed mindset about the purpose of life.

3.2 The essence of being 'human beings' signifies the faculty of understanding the feelings of other fellows. They show honest and unaffected concern for the well-being of other human beings on altruistic basis. They strive to assuage the suffering and provide a sigh of satisfaction to the welfare of others. Integrity, dignity, honesty, inherent truthfulness, trustworthiness, in both their words and actions are ultimate characteristics of being human.

3.3 The characteristic of *Being Human* is correlated to behavior towards the existence of others. It is a transformational journey from just living presently existence towards epistemological recognition of being present for the future. It signifies more contexts such as religious, social, political and moral applications in particular. It is not related to mere existence. It has potential aspirations to get best out of human beings to get the place of being human as the vicegerent of God and God becomes co-worker¹⁰ with human beings in forming the universe. God created Adam and human beings according to His own image. They were created with a purpose which was to be a vicegerent of God and its complete personification is the moral behavior of the Holy Prophet (PBUH).

3.4 The status of being human signifies the spiritual aspect also. Being the vicegerent of God on the earth: we have 'I and Thou' relation to God and a *humane* association with other fellows. We are taught that human life is sacred. The divine qualities such as: kindness, forgiveness, loyalty, sacredness, kind heartedness, compassionate, morality, the sense of right and wrong, thirst for knowledge, respect the existence of others, capability of understanding the sufferings and misfortunes of others, to do away with inflicting any pain, and to put a civilizing effect to whom or which we have direct or indirect involvement, make human beings as humane. These engrained qualities are the criteria of differentiation between the human

beings and being human. These all do not have any terrestrial gains but it focuses the spiritual satisfaction. Thus, becoming a factual *Human Being* is an ongoing spiritual expedition that ranges a lifetime endeavor. This has been professed by Urdu poet Mirza Ghalib:¹¹

بسکہ دشوار ہے ہر کام کا آساں ہونا
آدمی کو بھی میسر نہیں انساں ہونا

It is difficult to make everything easy; Even a Man cannot afford to be Human.

4. **Are 'Human Beings' equal to 'Being Human'?** Despite having the characteristics of anthropoids, the biological *human beings* can transform themselves into epistemological *being humans* through the process of learning. As Quran has mentioned two aspects of Adam's personality. Adam was a human being in the Gardens of Heaven and sent to the earth to live as 'Human Being' while the other side was Adam's 'Being Human' personality. This aspect signified the epistemological personality of Adam when he was taught the Names of the things and he was elevated from the fellow angels and they were ordered to prostrate before Adam because he knew what the angels did not know.¹²

وَعَلَّمَ آدَمَ الْأَسْمَاءَ كُلَّهَا ثُمَّ عَرَضَهُمْ عَلَى الْمَلَائِكَةِ
فَقَالَ أَنْبِئُونِي بِأَسْمَاءِ هَؤُلَاءِ إِنْ كُنْتُمْ صَادِقِينَ

He (God) taught Adam, the names of everything. He put them before the angels and asked, "State to Me, the names of the things, if whatever you have said is true?"

The angels could not do so and God said:¹³

قَالَ يَا آدَمُ أَنْبِئْهُمْ بِأَسْمَائِهِمْ ۖ فَلَمَّا أَنْبَأَهُمْ بِأَسْمَائِهِمْ
قَالَ أَلَمْ أَقُلْ لَكُمْ إِنِّي أَعْلَمُ الْغَيْبِ السَّمُوتِ وَالْأَرْضِ
وَأَعْلَمُ مَا تُبْدُونَ وَمَا كُنْتُمْ تَكْتُمُونَ

He said, to Adam. Tell to the angels the names. Adam did it, Allah said to the angels, Had I not told you that I knew whatever are the secrets in the heavens and in the earth, and I know whatever you are revealing and whatever you concealed.

Thus Epistemological personality of Adam was emphasized and he was exalted (to the rank of Being Human on the basis of epistemology) and he was revered by angels ¹⁴.

وَإِذْ قُلْنَا لِلْمَلَائِكَةِ اسْجُدُوا لِآدَمَ فَسَجَدُوا إِلَّا إِبْلِيسَ أَبَىٰ وَاسْتَكْبَرَ وَكَانَ مِنَ الْكَافِرِينَ

And remember, when He ordered the angels to Prostrate before Adam. All of them did so but not done by Iblis but he refused arrogantly to do so and become unfaithful.

5. **Leaning and Knowledge: The Standard of ‘Being Human’**

Oakeshott sets the standard that whom to be considered as being human; because becoming human is not just organic adaptation but it is entering into human conditions through learning the meanings of human inheritance. Learning means obtaining the ability to feel and to think and it does not mean simply to use information or to judge and interpret it but it is to recognize intellectual virtues. For him only the ‘human beings are capable of learning’. Thus, he considered that anyone is whatever the one learns to be or to become. Learning for Oakeshott is what Shakespeare said a matter of ‘*To Be or Not to be*’ that is the question.

Same difference between the learner and the ignorant had been emphasized by Quran that:¹⁵

قُلْ هَلْ يَسْتَوِي الَّذِينَ يَعْلَمُونَ وَالَّذِينَ لَا يَعْلَمُونَ ۗ إِنَّمَا يَتَذَكَّرُ أُولُو الْأَلْبَابِ

say, are the people who know and those who do not know have equal status?

None but the men of understanding will remember.

Quran denounces the ignorant as cattle,¹⁶

أَمْ تَحْسَبُ أَنَّ أَكْثَرَهُمْ يَسْمَعُونَ أَوْ يَعْقِلُونَ ۗ إِنْ هُمْ إِلَّا كَالْأَنْعَامِ بَلْ هُمْ أَضَلُّ سَبِيلًا

Do you consider, most of them have listened or understood? They are only just similar to cattle—but not, they are more than this, they have been strayed from the ‘Right’ path.

6. **Oakeshott’s Epistemology.** His epistemology had certain vital and unusual concepts which distinguished him from his predecessors and they are as follows:

6.1 **Theory of ‘Modes’.** Oakeshott’s epistemology or his theory of knowledge revolves around his theory of Modes and conversation. These

'Modes' explain the nature of experience. These are '*Scientific, 'Practical, 'History,*' and '*Poetry*'.¹⁷ The first mode describes the *quantity*, the second explains the profit, the third expounds the experience and ideas and the last one signified all aesthetic experiences. Experience at first appears as the simplest word but in fact it is most difficult term in philosophical inquiry. Experience is apparently a single concrete whole but it makes division of the experiencing one, the experience itself and the one which is being experiences.¹⁸ An 'experience is a world of ideas' and these ideas are abstractions. Thus the world is an abstraction. An experience is a whole of facts as truths and it is not a sum of things.¹⁹ We achieve just a world of ideas through experience.²⁰

These 'Modes' symbolizes various ways of understanding and approaching the realities. Depending on the circumstances, anyone can shift to any Mode and every Mode is related to one another because they all represent human experience.

6.2 The Idea of 'Conversation': The next concept which plays a vital role in Oakeshott's epistemology is the idea of 'conversation'. It means a sharing in the human experiences. It is not to win any debate but it is just an open-ended and ongoing contribution. It is a paradigm of modes of approaching the world and nexus of the diverse human voices. It is a proper '*image of human intercourse*'.²¹ Our ability to participate in the 'conversation' is the very mark of demarcation which qualifies us as civilized human beings in contrast to barbarian or animals.²² A conversation comprises of different voices or Modes. The participation in that conversation through any Mode means 'initiation into an inheritance'.²³ Everyone among us is inheritor to this conversation and inheritance of meanings. The exclusive technique to be called a human being is the learning of the meanings of that inheritance. Without it we are just biological human beings, barbarian or animals.

6.3 Concept of 'Errors' in Epistemology: For Oakeshott's concept of learning, the *Idea of Error* is very significant. According to his theory of Errors, human beings can commit errors. Errors are the building blocks of his theory knowledge. For this error making, he had opinion that learning takes

place in error not in ignorance.²⁴ Adam as a 'Human Being' committed error but on epistemological foundations as 'Being Human' he had the vision and deliberation to know then he was in fact exalted through his curiosity to know. Thus, for Oakeshott 'biological identity is not itself a human identity' but a just vital factor.²⁵ On this foundation, he elaborated his concept of epistemological concept of 'Being Human'.

6.4 The Role of Education in Transformation of the 'Human Beings' into 'Being Human'. Education is the process through which a teacher who is the custodian of civilization initiates a learner to learn the meaning of the conversations and civilization. These both are not material things but a whole of interlocking meanings thus education is for him: initiation into the techniques and participation in the conversation through which we become capable to recognize the modes and voices of participation in the intellectual activities and moral habits that suits to conversation.²⁶ Education is not a process to learn that how to do either this or that more capably instead it is obtaining, to some extent the comprehension of the human conditions which persistently enlighten the quality of life. It is also a kind of learning to know how to be an independent and civilized contributor to human life.²⁷ Thus the role of education is humanizing the human being (Homo Sapiens) into the 'Being Human' (the elevated Human Being which was emphasized by Islamic teachings also). That was the point which was highlighted by Timothy fuller that Oakeshott's philosophy of education is the philosophy of 'Learning to be Human'.²⁸

6.5 The inheritance of 'Meanings'. The inheritance does not mean the legacy of physical things as property or buildings which can be acquired by the progeny on the death of the father. Suppose anyone can buy a painting or a book or have a precious gift from someone especial, but none can buy the meanings of the painting, the understanding of the book or the feelings related to the gift. The meanings, understanding or the feelings cannot be bought. These are the abstract ideas and meanings that we had acquired from our forefathers and this collection is the inheritance to which we are successor.

The components of the inheritance are interlocking meanings²⁹ and its learning is regarded as the criterion of being Human by Oakeshott. The inheritance encompassed the achievements of our forefathers such as heritage of feelings, emotions, dreams, thoughts, beliefs, images, ideas, intellectual endeavors, language, theoretical understandings, and practical affairs, organizations, laws and manners of conduct, initiatives, processes, abilities, customs and rites, work of art, musical compositions, books, manuals, artefacts, apparatuses, instruments, and utensils.³⁰ The understanding of the meanings of these and likewise components is leaning of human conditions and the process of transforming into Being Human. According to him, human life is constituted on certain enactments and performances, and each undertaking is a disclosure of man's thoughts and beliefs about one's own self and about the world. That is why a person is what that the person thoughts to become.³¹ Education is realization of one's own self and being aware of the comprehension of the meanings of the world where the likewise beings are living. Thus education is a process of transforming oneself into being human then to be remained a human being.

6.6 The source of the inheritance of Meanings

We have an inheritance of meanings: for Islam it has been descended to us from God through the chain of Prophets: Quran said:³²

هُوَ الَّذِي بَعَثَ فِي الْأُمِّيِّينَ رَسُولًا مِنْهُمْ يَتْلُوا عَلَيْهِمْ آيَاتِهِ وَيُزَكِّيهِمْ
وَيُعَلِّمُهُمُ الْكِتَابَ وَالْحِكْمَةَ وَإِنْ كَانُوا مِنْ قَبْلُ لَفِي ضَلَالٍ مُّبِينٍ

He is the One Who has sent among the illiterate, a messenger from amongst themselves; reciting God's revelations to them and purify them along-with teaching them (Quran) the Book and wisdom, and indeed they were previously in astray clearly.

But Oakeshott had limited vision. He mentions that we have an inheritance of meanings from our forefathers who were the race of apes and they were used to sit for long. They had engagements of conversation. We, as civilized humans are the inheritor of this conversation. This makes a line of demarcation between a human being and an animal and also it differentiates a man from a barbarian being.³³ Every one of us is inheritor to this inheritance

of meanings. The learning of these meanings is the sole way to be called a human being and to live this world of meanings as a human being.

6.7 Who is the Heir to Legacy of Meanings? Every human being according to Oakeshott is born as inheritor to this legacy of meanings,³⁴ and learning of these meanings is mandatory for all who are to be considered Being Human. This had been emphasized as:³⁵

طَلَّبُ الْعِلْمِ فَرِيضَةٌ عَلَى كُلِّ مُسْلِمٍ وَ مُسْلِمَةٍ

It is mandatory for every Muslim man and woman to acquire knowledge. Thus learning is the criterion that transforms any human being to qualify as a Being Human. Otherwise the animals like horses and monkeys and octopus also living and performing certain tricks but they are not learners in the sense of being rational inheritor as '*being human*' but mere a 'human being' in the Home Sapiens sense or in the Islamic sense when Adam was made to learn the names and the meanings. For the entrance into the world of interlocking meanings and becoming 'being human', the visa is the learning.³⁶ This epistemological aspect of Oakeshott's idea of 'Being Human' on the epistemological basis gets support from Islam which highlighted the significance of learning and acquiring of knowledge from the Adam's learning the 'Name' and the meaning on the 'Shab-e-Alast' to the first revelation to the Last Prophet of Islam:³⁷

اقْرَأْ بِاسْمِ رَبِّكَ الَّذِي خَلَقَ

Read in The Name of your Lord Who has created.

عَلَّمَ الْإِنْسَانَ مَا لَمْ يَعْلَمْ

He has taught man that which he knew not

Thus due to learning the inheritance of meaning and acquiring knowledge, anyone get the status of 'being human' instead of just called 'human being'. On this account anyone can be an inhabitant of this world of interlocking meanings. That is why Oakeshott said that we are 'condemned to be a learner'³⁸ and this is life-long journey. For him none is born as (Being) Human but everyone is what the one learns to become.³⁹ He mentioned the reason of difference among ignorant and learner as well as the difference among various humans as to be dissimilar to each other. This dissimilarity is

due to the contents of learning that what anyone had actually learnt. This is learning due to which we can make most of ourselves and can get self-realization.⁴⁰ That is what The Quran mentioned:⁴¹

قُلْ هَلْ يَسْتَوِي الَّذِينَ يَعْلَمُونَ وَالَّذِينَ لَا يَعْلَمُونَ ۗ إِنَّمَا يَتَذَكَّرُ أُولُو الْأَلْبَابِ

say, are the people who know and those who do not know have equal status?

None but the men of understanding will remember.

7. **Morality: The *Summum Bonum* of 'Being Human'**. Life is a long journey in which we experience the world around us, we understand its intricacies, we make mistakes and learn to solve the problems, we interact with other fellows including family and society, help others to live better lives *etc.* All these have certain kinds of laws and regulation according to which the works of institution and society continues. But there is another kind of laws or a code that governs the human life. This code has been called Morality or the Ethical laws. These are considered the *summum Bonum* or the exaltation of human behavior to others. The human ways of dealing others, having the colours of these ethical goods of behavior and following these moral virtues and performing with the values of morality are recognized as the *summum Bonum* of human activities. This makes all activities as 'Humane' actions and related to Humanity.

8. What is humanity?

Related to the concept of 'Being Human', there is a word Humanity. It is used with a large number of perspectives, but generally it refers to kindness to living beings especially to humans and generally towards animals.

The acts of humanity have no inclination to get any personal gains of money, popularity or power but mere service of the society. Humanity is helping and caring the fellows in the time of need irrespective of any discrimination. Though all of us the 'Human Beings' claim to be 'Being Human' but in fact we are behaving just like 'human being. the true sense of 'Being Human' as an adjective and 'Humanity' as noun has been materialized by Mother Teresa, Ruth Pfau, Abdul Satar Eidhi who served the Humanity by sacrificing their own lives and they are the perfect model of Humanity and personification of 'Being Human'. The flawless and complete model has been materialized by the

Holy Prophet Muhammad (Peace Be Upon Him). They all were exemplification of real sympathy, kindness and humanity. We all pay gratitude to all the models but none of us are ready to exalt from the personal concerns and 'here and now' needs. That is why we are living in a society of human beings instead of being Human state.

For this exalted aim we must first realize the 'know thyself', learn how to relate ones' own self with others, that was the objective of Oakeshott's philosophy of learning the meanings through the vehicle of education. These all elements form Oakeshott's epistemology and theory of knowledge.

9. **Conclusion**

It is impossible to find a kind, benevolent and compassionate human being who has all knowledge since birth. To be a 'Being Humane' is a virtue and cultivating any virtue takes many years of hard learning and lifetime efforts in human conditions. Thus Oakeshott's philosophy of education as '*Learning to be Human*' is necessary. Because the world is full of 'Human Beings' as *Homo Sapiens*, or social animals; then there is a need to transform them into 'Being Human' so that they can live as 'Humane' on epistemological foundations instead to be led by instincts. For this the learning of the meanings of the essence of humanity, the status of being 'Humane' in human condition is necessary. Oakeshott's philosophy teaches us the meanings of all these ones that is why his education philosophy has worth to be flourished.

References

¹ Michael Oakeshott, *Experience and its Modes* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002). It was his PhD dissertation completed in 1933.

² Oakeshott, *Experience*, 9.

³ Oakeshott, *Experience*, 27.

⁴ Oakeshott, *Experience*, 13.

⁵ Oakeshott, *Experience*, 34.

⁶ Michael Oakeshott, *what is History and Other Essays*, (Exeter: Imprint Academic, 2004), 198.

⁷ Michael Oakeshott, *Rationalism in Politics and Other Essays* (London: Methuen & Co. Ltd., 1962), 199.

⁸ Oakeshott, *what is History*, 310.

⁹ Michael Oakeshott, *The Voice of Liberal Learning: Michael Oakeshott on Education*, (London: Yale University Press, 1989), 24.

- ¹⁰ Muhammad Iqbal, *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam*, ed. M. Saeed Shaikh (Lahore: Institute of Islamic Culture, 1986), 10.
- ¹¹ Mirza Asad Ullah Khan Ghalib, *Dewan e Ghalib* (Lahore: Chaudhry Academy, Al Fazal Market, Urdu Bazar, 2010), 60.
- ¹² Al Quran- Al Baqarh 2:31
- ¹³ Al Quran- Al Baqarh 2:33
- ¹⁴ Al Quran- Al Baqarh 2:34
- ¹⁵ Al Quran- Al Zumar 39:9
- ¹⁶ Al Quran- Al Furqan-25:44
- ¹⁷ Oakeshott, *Experience*, 84.
- ¹⁸ Oakeshott, *Experience*, 9-10.
- ¹⁹ Oakeshott, *Experience*, 27.
- ²⁰ = Oakeshott, *Experience*, 34.
- ²¹ Oakeshott, The Voice of Poetry in the Conversation of Mankind, in *Rationalism in Politics and Other Essays* (London: Methuen & Co. Ltd., 1962), 198.
- ²² Oakeshott, *Rationalism*, 199.
- ²³ Oakeshott, *Rationalism*, 129.
- ²⁴ Oakeshott, *The Voice of Liberal Learning*, 59.
- ²⁵ Oakeshott, *The Voice*, 33.
- ²⁶ Oakeshott, *Rationalism*, 199
- ²⁷ Oakeshott, *The Voice*, 71.
- ²⁸ <http://dgmyers.blogspot.com/p/the-voice-of-liberal-learning-michael.html>
Timothy Fuller mentioned the heading in the above lecture.
"Learning to Be Human: Oakeshott on Education", originally published in the American Scholar 59 (Autumn 1990): 626–28.
- ²⁹ Oakeshott, *The Voice*, 45
- ³⁰ Oakeshott, *The Voice*, 45
- ³¹ Oakeshott, "Education: The Engagement and its Frustration," in *The Voice of Liberal Learning*, 64.
- ³² Al Quran- Al Jumuah 62:2
- ³³ Oakeshott, *Rationalism*, 199.
- ³⁴ Oakeshott, *The Voice*, 45.
- ³⁵ Sunan Ibn Maja, Hadith no. 224.
- ³⁶ Michael Oakeshott, "Learning and Teaching," in *The Concept of Education*, ed. R. S. Peters (London: Routledge and Kagan Paul, 2010), 109.
- ³⁷ Al-Alaq- 96:1, 5.
- ³⁸ Oakeshott, *The Voice of Liberal Learning*, 23.
- ³⁹ Oakeshott, *The Voice*, 21.
- ⁴⁰ Oakeshott, *The Voice*, 47.
- ⁴¹ Al Quran Al-Zamur 39:9.